## Comparing the Ideas

## Yuma County Rail Corridor and Logistics Study

Yuma
San Luis
Cocopah
Wellton
Somerton
Yuma County
ADOT

								0
Criterion	No Build	Unit Refrigerated Train Service Alt. 1	Industrial Park in Wellton Alt. 2	Transload Rail Park Alt. 3	Distribution Hub at Wellton Alt. 4	Punta Colonet Connection Alt. 5	Industrial Park in San Luis with New Rail Line Alt. 6	New Rail Alignment to Connect to Ferromex Alt. 7
Alternative Description	No requirements	Unit train service for Yuma and/or Mexican fresh and frozen produce is initiated to hub location(s) such as Chicago, New York, Dallas. A consolidation facility is constructed in conjunction with the rail service. The service is analogous to the RailEx service in California and Washington State or the Cold Train service in Washington State. The service could be based on either bimodal or trailer on flatcar to speed transit times.	A spur track is built to provide access to the Wellton Mohawk site for an industrial park. In conjunction, a short line rail carrier provides switching at site, as well as over the Sunset Corridor to shippers in Yuma. Transload and storage facilities are constructed in conjunction with the facility.	Transload facility is built in the region. At first, the facility consists of "team tracks" where freight is transferred between trucks and railcars. As usage increases, fixed material handling and storage facilities are added.	A distribution hub is established in Wellton on the existing Wellton Branch Line, in conjunction with a new UP intermodal terminal with service between Yuma and Dallas, Chicago, etc.	A megaport is built at Punta Colonet, Mexico and a new rail line connection is built which joins the UP Sunset Corridor at or near Yuma. The Yuma community positions itself to be a distribution hub associated with the port.	A new rail corridor is built which leaves the Union Pacific Sunset Corridor in or near Yuma, extends along the SR195 alignment to near the San Luis POE II. New multimodal facility is built along with 22-miles of new rail line. (Assumes Punta Colonet is not built)	As an extension of Alternative 6, a new rail corridor (24 miles long) that crosses the border near San Luis II, and joins the Ferromex Calexico subdivision just east of Cd Coahuila. Rail line is promoted as a U.S. connection to Port of Guaymas. (Assumes Punta Colonet is not built)
Risk of Failure	No Risk	High     Yuma's most useable crops (winter vegetables) require daily shipping.     Difficult to fill enough trains.     Difficult to fill trains during off season of crops.	Medium Risk of vacancy within industrial park.	Low • Threshold level is low, only 300 to 500 carloads per year. (Even if only two percent of truckloads diverted from industries that frequently use transload, this would be 575 carloads.)	High     Intermodal terminals not scaleable.     Yuma unlikely to generate threshold volumes of freight.     Competition with existing terminals in Phoenix and Tucson.     Awkward location for handling freight to/from California.	Low  Overall risk of failure building a megaport in Mexico may be significant, but most risk is on other stakeholders in the U.S. and Mexico (not Yuma County).	Low    Definition of failure = cessation of rail service.    Once built, likely some rail service provided.	Low  Definition of failure = cessation of rail service.  Once built, likely some rail service provided.
<b>Economic</b> Benefit	No Benefit	High     Serve established shippers in Yuma.     Improve Yuma's market share in produce.     Encourage frozen food operators to locate in Yuma.	High Could attract new businesses to the area. (If as successful as Kingman, eventually over 2,000 jobs.)	Only occasional use by most shippers. Unlikely to draw new employers.     Cost of trucking to facility and transferring reduces savings from using rail.	Medium     Intermodal terminal itself not a large employer.     Some jobs generated by logistics and distribution businesses.	High     Border rail operation brings direct employment to Yuma County.     Additional transportation, and distribution jobs likely to be created by containers distributed through Yuma County.	High Attract new businesses to the area. (If as successful as Kingman, eventually over 2,000 jobs.)	Relatively low density rail line.     Most traffic would pass through Yuma. Trade with Mexico is a very small percentage traffic to and from Yuma.
Size of Investment	No Cost	Medium  If cost similar to RailEx facility in Wallula, WA, total cost = \$34 million with around \$8 million in public sector funding. (The Cold Train service received about \$2 million in public sector funding, although the infrastructure used by the service at the Port of Quincy had previously received \$5.7 million in public sector funding.)	Medium     Depends upon what is built, but public sector contribution would probably be limited to building rail infrastructure into the park, perhaps less than \$10 million. Additional infrastructure improvements may bring significant cost.	Low  Depends upon what is built. Simple team track less than \$2 million. If were to build same as Somerset Rail Park, would be \$8.5 million, escalated to today's dollars.	Medium Intermodal terminal costing at least \$25 - \$30 million.	Medium     Local region may contribute to infrastructure which benefits the region, such as an intermodal terminal.     Estimated cost between \$25 million and \$60 million.	High • Estimated cost = excess of \$70 million	High • Estimated cost = excess of \$80 million.
Negative Impacts	No impact	Nay be implications to highway/rail at-grade crossings.     Need to make sure facility does not compete with preexisting privately funded facilities.	Low • Would primarily use existing rail infrastructure.	Need to be sure facility does not compete with preexisting privately funded facilities.     Relies on existing rail infrastructure.	Low Relies on existing rail infrastructure.	High  May be implications to highway/rail at-grade crossings.  Some land to be acquired.	High Highway/rail at-grade crossings requried. Some land to be acquired. A section of I-8 may need to be rebuilt.	Highway/rail at-grade crossings required. Some land to be acquired. A section of I-8 may need to be rebuilt.
Obstacles	No Obstacles	Medium Requires agreement among numerous parties, including a private investor to operate the service, railroads, etc.	Medium Need private developer to lead project. Owners of site need to be interested.	Need private operator.     Entry barriers for this types of facility is not as high as other alternatives.     Not large site.	High     UP Railroad needs to be convinced to add terminal to its intermodal network.     Yuma's location between Southern California and Sun Corridor is an awkward location in UP's network     UP focused on building and improving much larger terminals.	High     Project depends on actions of the Government of Mexico.     UP has disengaged from the project.	High     Right of way or easement would need to be acquired.     Full NEPA process required.     In order to avoid developed areas, the alignment would approach the Sunset Corridor on the wrong side of I-8.	High Right of way or easement to be acquired. Full NEPA process required. In order to avoid developed areas, the alignment would approach the Sunset Corridor on the wrong side of I-8. Need to obtain a presidential permit and establish new POE. Need to gain cooperation of Ferromex, government and communities in Mexico.
PROS	No impact	Serve established shippers in Yuma.     Could improve Yuma's market share in produce .     Encourage frozen food operators to locate in Yuma.	Bring economic development and jobs to Yuma	to have access to the railroad network	Bring jobs and economic development to Yuma	Inspection of containers generates jobs for region.	Provides a long-term alternate transportation option. Bring economic development and jobs to Yuma County.	Could provide a long-term alternate transportation option
<u>a</u>		Could provide significant benefits to Yuma shippers	Relies on existing rail infrastructure	Relatively little public sector investment. Relies on existing rail infrastructure.	Relies on existing rail infrastructure			
CONS	No impact	Difficult to achieve needed transit time for leafy greens	Minimal inconvenience     Risk of park vacancy	Minimal inconvenience     Research suggests only occasion usage by most shippers.	Minimal inconvenience     Yuma County's ability to compete as a logistics hub is speculative (only a small portion of Yuma's	Land acquisition required.	High Cost	High Cost
		Uncertainty of freight volume to justify frequency of service.	Need private sector investor	Need to ensure project does not interfere with other privately funded operations	economy now).      Yuma County too close to Los Angeles for Union Pacific Railroad to provide intermodal service between Yuma and the Los Angeles metropolitan region. Service would need to be between Yuma and point further east.	Somewhat speculative; relies on actions of the Government of Mexico and other stakeholders.	Requires agreements with the US Department of Defense.	Likely usage of the rail line difficult to justify in terms of cost/benefit.
		Service must be supported by local shippers to ensure that it is not competing against an existing, privately financed service.	Assumes interest from owners of site	Cooperation by UP and other parties is speculative	High risk if terminal is built before necessary agreements in place. May be significant challenge to gain agreement from UP.		Alignment must pass through developed areas or would interfere with I-8	Relatively minor economic impact on Yuma (relatively little cross-border traffic originates or terminates in Yuma).
				Unlikely to attract new employers to region by itself.	Yuma County not located within either the Southern California or the Arizona Sun Corridor megaregions.     Yuma County located too far south to also serve Northern California and Front Range megaregions.			Requires some disruption and condemnation of property.
					Options for international distribution may be limited. (Most retail distribution centers are nation-specific.)			Intermodal rail service between Guaymas and Yuma is speculative (Guaymas maritime intermodal service began on a very limited basis only several months ago, and no rail intermodal service is currently available at Guaymas).